

TWELFTH WORKSHOP OF PARLIAMENTARY SCHOLARS AND PARLIAMENTARIANS
Wroxton, July 2015

Battles on Many Fronts: Education Scrutiny and Debate in the
21st Century House of Commons

J David Morgan (Associate Lecturer, The Open University)

1 Introduction

Opportunities for scrutiny of "Education issues" in the House of Commons have grown significantly in the last half a century. A system of departmental select committees has been set up and developed. There is now greater scope for debates, particularly in "Westminster Hall" and more time is allocated for debates initiated by backbenchers and select committees. Parliamentary questions have evolved.

This paper will look at the various fora and tools available for scrutiny of "Education issues" in the final session of the 2010 Parliament, and the first weeks of the 2015 Parliament. It builds upon the paper, "Opposition Members and the Education Select Committee" presented at the Political Studies Association in Sheffield in March 2015, and which is available from the author at jdavidmorgan@washminster.com

Nick Gibb told the Public Bill Committee on the Education and Adoption Bill that "*the Secretary of State does have to answer for everything that she does. She answers to us in the House at least once a month in Education questions, but also in other debates – Opposition day debates, Adjournment debates, Back-Bench debates and so on.*"¹

The following table sets out the main fora for scrutiny, and describes and gives examples of their use in education.

Type	S.O	Frequency	Comments & Examples
Oral Questions – Secretary of State for Education		Each 5 th sitting Monday	2014-5: 16/06/14 , 21/07/14 , 27/10/14 , 01/12/14 , 19/01/15 , 02/03/15 2015-16: 15/06/15 , 20/07/15
Other Departmental Oral Questions		Each sitting day except Fridays	When an issue involves responsibilities of that department – eg. Apprenticeships , Basic Maths & English Skills (BIS), Child Abuse (Home), Homophobic Bullying , Encouraging girls into STEM careers (Equalities)

¹ Parliamentary Debates: Public Bill Committee: Education and Adoption Bill (Bill 004), Sixth Sitting, Tuesday 7 July 2015 (Afternoon) Col 196

Prime Ministers Questions		Each sitting Wednesday	Frequently used by backbenchers (constituency issues or general matter of current or constant interest), sometimes by Leader of Opposition .
Business Questions		Each sitting Thursday	Questions generally begin with - "may we have a debate..." "Will my right hon. Friend arrange for a debate to be held in Government time..." "Will the Leader of the House find time for a debate on ..."
Ministerial Statements		As required	Birmingham Schools – 09/06/15 ; 22/07/14 ; 29/01/15 ; Other Departments' statements on child sexual abuse – Home Secretary 04/02/15 ; SoS for Communities & Local Govt 04/02/15 ;
Urgent Questions		As required	Child Sexual Exploitation (Oxfordshire) 03/03/15 ; 45 UQs granted in 2014-15. ²
Opposition Business Debates	14(2)	20 days per session	Reforming technical & vocational education – 09/07/14 ; Infant Class sizes 03/09/14 ; Apprenticeships 04/02/15 ; (see also HoC Library Standard Note SN/PC/06315 for period June 2010-Nov 2014)
Back Bench Debates	14(4)	35 days per session (of which up to 7 may be in Westminster Hall)	Social Mobility/Child Poverty Strategy 03/07/14 ; Provision of education for children with autism 17/07/14 ; Achievement gap in reading between poorer children and their better off peers 04/09/14
Daily Adjournment Debates	9(7)	Daily	May cover national - Asbestos in Schools 17/03/15 ; Lesser Taught Languages 24/03/15 ; Or constituency issues - Child Sexual Exploitation (Rotherham) 26/02/15 ; Allocation of primary school places in Bromley 12/09/14 ;
Estimates Days	54	3 days per session	'for debates on Select Committee Reports' ³ None on Education Committee Reports, but debate on Health Ctte Report on Child & Adolescents Mental Health Services 03/03/15
Primary Legislation - Government			2014-15: No DfE sponsored Bill but Treasury sponsored the Childcare Payments Bill – and 2 opposition members of the Education Select Committee sat on the PBC 2015-16: Education and Adoption Bill

² Sessional Returns 2014-15 HC1

³ Rogers, R and Walters, R. *How Parliament Works*. 7th Edition. Routledge, 2015. p75

Primary Legislation - PMBs	14(8)	13 Fridays per session	2014-15: Personal, Health & Economic Education (Statutory Requirement) Bill ; School Admissions Bill ; Neither proceeded far.
10 Minute Rule Bills	23	Tues & Weds from 7 th week of the session	2014-15 – Sex & Relationships Education (Curriculum) Bill ; School Governors (Appointment) Bill ; Apprenticeships (Child Benefit & Tax Credit Entitlement (Research) Bill ; Schools (Opportunity to Study for Qualifications) Bill
Secondary Legislation	16,17, 151	Frequent	Usually without debate. Consideration by Statutory Instruments (Joint Committee) ; or the Select Committee on Statutory Instruments .
Westminster Hall Debates	10, 14(4)		Most commonly used forum for debate. Author identified at least 30 WH debates related to Education. Days from June 2014 to July 2015. Departments are allocated specific weeks to answer debates. See http://www.parliament.uk/about/how/business/westminster-hall-debates/

Table 1 – Fora for Parliamentary Scrutiny

2 Methodology

[1] Education Select Committee

As part of this research the public meetings of the committee were attended by the author on 15th, 21st, 22nd October; 4th, 5th, 19th November; 10th December[2014] ; 28th January; 11th February; 11th & 18th March [2015]. Notes were taken and observations made.

Interviews were conducted with members of the committee.

Transcripts of all meetings during the period from 15th October 2014 to 18th March 2015 were acquired.⁴ Other transcripts outside this period; Final Reports; and Sessional Returns for the first three sessions (2010-12; 2012-13 and 2013-14) were also acquired and used for background detail and cross-checking evidence.

For this study the transcripts of the following hearings were analysed. All involved evidence given to the committee by Department for Education ministers.

⁴ Education Committee website - <http://www.parliament.uk/business/committees/committees-a-z/commons-select/education-committee/>

Date	Witness	Inquiry	Questions
15/10/14	Nicky Morgan (Secretary of State)	Extremism in Schools (HC 473)	308-471
22/10/14	Nicky Morgan	Academies and free schools (HC 258)	1143-1356
3/12/14	Nicky Morgan	Examinations for 15-19 year olds in England: Follow-up (HC 143)	85-233
17/12/14	Nick Gibb Minister of State (Schools Reform)	Personal, Social, Health & Economic Education in Schools (HC 145)	389-517
14/01/15	Nick Boles Minister of State (Skills and Equalities)	Apprenticeships and traineeships for 16-19 year olds (HC 597)	384-484
04/03/15	Nick Gibb	Evidence Check: Starting school (HC1039)	80-157
11/03/15	Sam Gyimah Parliamentary Under Secretary of State (Childcare & Education)	Foundation Years: Sure Start children's centres: follow up (HC 1017)	1-141

Table 2 – Transcripts Analysed

Biographical information was obtained from publicly available information and the members themselves.

[2] Education and Adoption Bill 2015

The Second Reading (date) and all public meetings of the Public Bill Committee were attended by the author. Hansard (Daily Report of the Commons Debates 22nd June 2015) and Reports of Proceedings, General Committees (PBC (Bill 004) 2015-2016) were consulted and are quoted in this paper.

[3] Other Parliamentary Activity

Consideration was given to other related parliamentary activity. Contributions made by MPs in Chamber debates; Westminster Hall debates; adjournment debates; and Oral Parliamentary Questions were considered. Hansard was used for this research. Reference has been made to the Sessional Returns of the House of Commons, and various committee reports.

3 The Education Select Committee

This Departmental Select Committee was set up in 1979, as the Education, Science and Arts Committee. It has undergone a number of name changes and variation in responsibilities in the subsequent thirty-six years, to mirror changes in the Department itself. The latest change in name was made on 15th June 2010.⁵ Rush noted that “*the lineage of (the committee) can be traced back through the Education, Arts and Home Office Sub-Committee of the former Expenditure Committee to two of the old ‘Crossman committees’ – the Select Committee on Education and Science, and the much longer-lived Science and Technology Committee.*”⁶

Its responsibilities are governed by Standing Order 152 which states that “*Select committees shall be appointed to examine the expenditure, administration and policy of the principal government*

⁵ Standing Orders of the House of Commons: Public Business. 2015 p xvii

⁶ Rush, Michael ‘The Education, Science and Arts Committee’ in Drewry, Gavin ‘The New Select Committees (2nd Edition) p88

departments” (in this case the Department for Education)...and associated public bodies.”⁷ The committee has a series of pages on the Parliamentary website.⁸

During the 2010 Parliament (55th Parliament of the United Kingdom), there have been 19 members who have sat on the 11 member committee.

Member	Party	Appointed	Left	Attendance			
				2010-12	2012-13	2013-14	2014-15
Graham Stuart (Chair)	Cons	12/07/10		76/76	38/45	41/49	31/36
Conor Burns	Con	12/07/10	02/11/10	4/9	n/a	n/a	n/a
Damian Hinds	Con	12/07/10	05/11/12	71/76	13/19	n/a	n/a
Charlotte Leslie	Con	12/07/10	04/11/13	54/76	22/45	4/22	n/a
Craig Whittaker	Con	12/07/10		59/76	32/45	30/49	25/36
Neil Carmichael	Con	02/11/10		57/67	36/45	33/49	20/36
Chris Skidmore	Con	05/11/12	18/03/14	n/a	11/26	14/41	n/a
Dominic Raab	Con	04/11/13		n/a	n/a	17/27	19/36
Caroline Nokes	Con	18/03/14		n/a	n/a	8/8	21/36
Tessa Munt	LD	12/07/10	11/06/12	64/76	0/3	n/a	n/a
David Ward	LD	09/06/12		n/a	39/42	37/49	30/36
Nic Dakin	Lab	12/07/10	07/11/11	43/51	n/a	n/a	n/a
Pat Glass	Lab	12/07/10		62/76	33/45	34/49	25/36
Liz Kendall	Lab	12/07/10	02/11/10	6/9	n/a	n/a	n/a
Ian Mearns	Lab	12/07/10		65/76	43/45	34/49	15/36
Lisa Nandy	Lab	12/07/10	10/09/12	46/76	0/11	n/a	n/a
Bill Esterson	Lab	02/11/10		25/67	23/45	32/49	28/36
Alex Cunningham	Lab	07/11/11		17/25	36/45	37/49	30/36
Siobhain McDonagh	Lab	10/09/12		n/a	26/34	31/49	24/36

Table 3 – Membership of Education Select Committee of 2010 Parliament⁹

During the 2010 Parliament 30 reports were published and 159 oral evidence sessions were undertaken. Some inquiries lasted many months, whilst some involved only a single hearing. The committee reported that it had heard from 727 witnesses and received more than 2,300 written submissions.¹⁰

The committee has introduced a number of innovations. It has experimented with Twitter, with questions tweeted in and then put to the witness.¹¹ In the last session the committee, “conducted an ‘evidence check’ process where we asked the DfE to set out the evidence base for a number of its policies and then invited members of the public to comment on this evidence using a forum which we hosted on the Parliament website. Following these discussions we focused our attention on two policies, on the National College of Teaching and Leadership and those relating to school starting age, and held two one-off evidence sessions further to explore the Department’s evidence base for its policies.”¹²

⁷ Standing Orders of the House of Commons: Public Business. 2015

⁸ <http://www.parliament.uk/business/committees/committees-a-z/commons-select/education-committee/>

⁹ Sessional Returns 2010-12; 2012-13; 2013-14, 2014-15

¹⁰ Closing the gap: the work of the Education Committee in the 2010-15 Parliament. 8th Report of Session 2014-15 HC 1120 (16 Mar 2015) p3

¹¹ See Closing the gap: the work of the Education Committee in the 2010-15 Parliament. 8th Report of Session 2014-15 HC 1120 (16 Mar 2015) p3-4

¹² Closing the gap: the work of the Education Committee in the 2010-15 Parliament. 8th Report of Session 2014-15 HC 1120 (16 Mar 2015) p4 (paragraph 6)

In the 2015 Parliament a new Chair was elected, Neil Carmichael, who had served on the committee since November 2010.

		MP since	Other
Neil Carmichael	Cons	2010	Member, Education Select Ctte 2010-, Established APPG - Governance and Leadership in Education ¹³
Lucy Allan	Cons	2015	Family Rights Campaigner
Ian Austin	Lab	2005	Former Government Assistant Whip; Minister & Shadow Minister
Michelle Donelan	Cons	2015	
Marion Fellows	SNP	2015	SNP Whip; FE Lecturer;
Suella Fernandes	Cons	2015	Co-founder of the Michaela Community School (Free School in Brent)
Lucy Frazer	Cons	2015	Grand-daughter of Dr Hyman Frazer – Mathematician, Barrister & Educationalist.
Kate Hollern	Lab	2015	Former Contracts Manager at Blackburn College.
Ian Mearns	Lab	2010	Member, Education Select Ctte 2010-, Chair, Backbench Business Committee. Chair of governors at a comprehensive school for 10 years; a primary school for 2 years and 10 years at a special school for children with moderate learning difficulties.) He was awarded a distinction as runner-up in the National DFES Teaching awards “Governor of the Year” category for the North East & Cumbria 2007. ¹⁴
Caroline Nokes	Cons	2010	Member, Education Select Ctte 2014-
Kate Osamor	Lab	2015	“active in Haringey, campaigning against forced academies..” ¹⁵

Table 4 – Membership of Education Select Committee, 2015^{16, 17}

Committee meetings take place on a frequent basis. Most commonly the committee will hold evidence sessions which are open to the public on Wednesday mornings when the House is in session. There have been additional hearings on other days, and some weeks have not had any hearings. These are frequently preceded by a brief private meeting of the committee. Other private meetings and seminars have been held.

Transcripts of the seven hearings were analysed and eleven categories were identified. In most cases it was clear what source was used. In others it was less clear. An attempt was made to identify the original source when there was a possibility it might have been earlier written or oral evidence given to the committee. This was not always possible, and it may be that some information contained in this analysis as “G – Reference to material the Member has seen” may actually be better reallocated to

¹³ <http://www.neilcarmichael.co.uk/about-neil>

¹⁴ <http://www.ianmearns.org.uk/>

¹⁵ <http://www.kateosamor.co.uk/about/>

¹⁶ <http://www.publications.parliament.uk/pa/cm201516/cmhansrd/cm150706/debtext/150706-0004.htm#1507071000003> :

¹⁷ <http://www.parliament.uk/business/committees/committees-a-z/commons-select/education-committee/news-parliament-2015/chair-elected/>

categories B, F, or H. Further information on these categories can be found in the paper "Opposition Members and the Education Select Committee"

Category	Cunningham	Esterson	Glass	McDonagh	Mearns	Total	%
A – Personal Experience			14			14	10.29
B – Issue raised with the MP	1	2		3	1	7	5.15
C – Local information			2	1	1	4	2.94
D – Visit by the MP		1	2			3	2.21
E – Media article	1		1			2	1.47
F – Earlier evidence taken by the Committee	10	8	32	4	7	61	44.85
G – Material seen by the MP	1		3		4	8	5.88
H – Earlier Report by Committee or observations made during an earlier hearing			7			7	5.15
I – Issue raised within the House of Commons		3	2			5	3.68
J – Ministerial Communication with MP	1	1			3	2	1.47
K – “Other people have said”	5	5	10			23	16.91

Table 5 – Use of sources in questions

The Department for Education, which the Education Departmental Select Committee scrutinises, is responsible for

- teaching and learning for children in the early years and in primary schools
- teaching and learning for young people under the age of 19 years in secondary schools and in further education
- supporting professionals who work with children and young people
- helping disadvantaged children and young people to achieve more
- making sure that local services protect and support children¹⁸

This excludes Higher Education, and some topics cross departmental boundaries. The Department for Business, Innovation and Skills works “with further and higher education providers to give students the skills they need to compete in a global employment market”¹⁹, while children’s health is a matter both the DfE and the Department of Health have an interest in. Adult Literacy and Numeracy was the subject of a Business, Innovation and Skills Committee Report in the 2014-15 Session.

The Public Accounts Committee took evidence from eight “*officials from, or representatives of*” the Department for Education and two from Ofsted. The committee reported on “School oversight and intervention”²⁰; “16- to 18-year-old participation in education and training”²¹, and “Children in Care”²²

¹⁸ DfE website: <https://www.gov.uk/government/organisations/department-for-education/about>

¹⁹ BIS website <https://www.gov.uk/government/organisations/department-for-business-innovation-skills/about>

²⁰ School oversight and intervention - 32nd Report 2014-15 HC 735

²¹ 16- to 18-year-old participation in education and training – 31st Report 2014-15 HC 707

²² Children in Care - 44th Report 2014-15 HC 809

4 Proceedings on Legislation

There was no bill sponsored by the Department for Education during the 2014-15 session.

The Childcare Payments Bill was sponsored by HM Treasury. It was considered by a 19 member Public Bill Committee which included 2 members of the Education Select Committee and one former member.

The DfE sponsored the [Education & Adoption Bill 2015](#), “A Bill to make provision about schools in England that are causing concern, including provision about their conversion into Academies and about intervention powers; and to make provision about joint arrangements for carrying out local authority adoption functions in England.”

First Reading	03/06/15
Second Reading	22/06/15
Public Bill Committee	Evidence Sessions: 30/06/15 1st & 2nd Sitting Line by Line Consideration: 02/07/15 3rd & 4th Sittings; 07/07/15 5th & 6th Sittings; 09/07/15 7th & 8th Sittings; 14/07/15 9th & 10th Sittings

Table 6 – Education & Adoption Bill 2015

The Public Bill Committee of 20 members included eight Freshmen. Ten members were Conservatives, seven were Labour, there was one Liberal-Democrat, and one DUP member who did not attend. Nick Gibb and Edward Timpson were the Department for Education Ministers, while Kevin Brennan and Steve McCabe were the shadow ministers. Margot James was the Conservative whip and Graham Jones the Labour whip.

The Chair at the start of the first Line by Line Consideration sitting began with a useful introduction to procedure in the Committee.²³

The first two sittings of the PBC saw evidence taken from 22 witness; the final three being DfE Ministers, Nick Gibb MP; Edward Timpson MP; and Lord Nash. Gibb and Timpson were members of the PBC.

The committee received a wide range of submissions from outside Parliament.²⁴

Many of the amendments were “probing amendments”, (7, 8, 14, 15, 21, 22, 26, 27, 28, 29, 33, 35, 37, 38, 42, 55, 56, 57, 59, 61, 63, 67, 68, 72 & 77) - identified in the explanatory statements or the remarks made by members recorded in the transcripts of the committee’s sessions) designed to “get the minister to clarify provisions of the bill and outline the thinking behind them.”²⁵ Amendments sought to change the bill²⁶ –

Requiring parliamentary approval for the actions of the Secretary of State	1,2,3,4,5,6,19,34,58,62,64,79,80,
Requiring the SoS to disclose the criteria against which bodies are selected to take on functions	7,
Requiring the SoS to consult before doing a specific action	12,31,32,50,51,52,

²³ See Cols 95 & 96 [3rd Sitting Thursday 2 July 2015](#)

<http://www.publications.parliament.uk/pa/cm201516/cmpublic/educationadoption/150702/am/150702s01.pdf>

²⁴ See <http://services.parliament.uk/bills/2015-16/educationandadoption/documents.html> and 9th Sitting Tuesday 14 July 2015 (just before 09.40 am)

²⁵ Rogers, R and Walters, R. *How Parliament Works*. 7th Edition. Routledge, 2015. p190

²⁶ Derived from Member’s explanatory statements on Amendment Papers and transcripts of the sessions.

Requiring the SoS to seek independent advice before doing a specific action	24,26,39,
Requiring the SoS to take account of certain things	25, 27 NC1,
Requiring the SoS to publish a statement or lay a report before Parliament	11,45,
Requiring the SoS to set out certain things in regulations	68,69,70,71,73, 80,
Restricting the frequency of the use by the SoS of a power	61,74
Requiring certain things be included in regulations	75,76,
Requiring the SoS to maintain a list of approved persons or bodies	53,
Removing a requirement that the SoS be informed about a specific thing.	23,
Preventing bodies from taking on specific function, through the changing of criteria	8,
Requiring independent inspection and monitoring of directions issued by the SoS	10,
Changing or adding definitions (including consequential amendments)	9,22,28,44,47,48,49,54,55,56,59, 66,67,78,
Requiring that certain organisations or types of organisation have the opportunity to carry out particular tasks	13,
Setting periods for consultation; response to a notice issued; compliance	14,15, NC3,
Requiring that a minimum time must elapse before a notice from the SoS can take effect	38,72,
Changing who may, or may not do something, when certain conditions exist	16,17,18,49,
Restoring previous legislative provisions	20,21
Dis-applying a provision in certain circumstances	37,77,
Adding options available to a body (eg. a school)	29,
Adding options available to the SoS	30,
Requiring the SoS for pay for expenditure incurred by another body	33,35,60,
Requiring the SoS to comply with agreements between third parties	36
Establishing the date when a power becomes available to the SoS	46,
Removing certain circumstances from the scope of a provision in the Bill	41,42,43,
Changing a duty of the SoS into a power	40,
Creating new duties for Ofsted	NC2,
Creating new powers for Ofsted	81,NC4,

Table 7 – Purpose of Amendments

Arguments used during the committee stage stressed Parliament’s responsibility and interest in scrutiny. The committee was told, “*We are here to scrutinise legislation, safeguard against excesses on the part of the Executive and ensure that Parliament, not Ministers, provides the checks and balances on excessive use of power.*”²⁷

Steve McCabe spoke of the “*Government intention to delegate substantial powers to the Minister ... without any further reference to Parliament or scrutiny by parliamentarians*”²⁸ He noted that “*we are being asked to give extensive powers to the Minister – to the Minister of the day – but Ministers come*

²⁷ Col 98 3rd Sitting Thursday 2 July 2015

²⁸ Cols 96 & 97 3rd Sitting Thursday 2 July 2015

and Ministers go, so we can have no guarantee that the present incumbent's successor would necessarily take a similarly benign view of such matters."²⁹

In a later session Kevin Brennan argued, *"As the Bill removes the power of a governing body to appeal against a warning notice, the amendment would insert, as an alternative way of getting some measure of appeal, direct accountability for all decisions to intervene by the Secretary of State. It would require those interventions to be made via the mechanism of a statutory instrument...It is clear from this and other actions by the Government that the Government lack confidence in Ofsted... However, just because the Government have lost faith in Ofsted's ability to hear an appeal of this kind, that does not mean that they should completely abandon basic principles of natural justice. If Ofsted is not trusted by the Minister for Schools and the Secretary of State in this respect, surely something else should be put in its place as a safeguard against the arbitrary use of ministerial power... as the Minister himself pointed out earlier in today's proceedings, we are legislating for all future possibilities, including the most unlikely of possibilities for who might be sitting in his seat or the Secretary of State's seat in the future... we are legislating for all future Ministers, so we should be vigilant about legislating for anything that allows the arbitrary use of power by Ministers... Amendment 19 means that, when issuing a notice, the Secretary of State would have to do so by order, rather than by direction. There would therefore be an opportunity for Members to pray against the statutory instrument ... or, in effect, to put a question mark against what the Minister is doing to trigger at least a debate on the use of the power, against which the right of appeal is being removed from governing bodies."*³⁰

Minister of State Nick Gibb, pointed out that *"the Secretary of State and the regional school commissioners acting on her behalf have a common law duty to act rationally and reasonably—the same common law duty that applies to local authorities."*³¹ The costs and delay of judicial review were highlighted by Kevin Brennan, adding, *"If there were a parliamentary process by which ...decisions could be scrutinised, it would be much more efficient."*³²

The Minister addressed the issue of delegated powers, *"It should also be borne in mind that regional schools commissioners are exercising the Secretary of State's powers and the Secretary of State is accountable to Parliament for any decisions that regional schools commissioners make."*³³

Concerns expressed by the House of Lords Constitution Committee in two recent reports were highlighted. That committee had stated *"we see the continuation of a trend that was evident during the last Parliament—a tendency towards the introduction of vaguely worded legislation that leaves much to the discretion of ministers"*³⁴ adding *"the House may wish to be mindful of this trend as further legislation is introduced during this Parliament, and to ensure that bills contain an appropriate level of detail and provide a suitable degree of legal certainty."*³⁵ Kevin Brennan told the Public Bill Committee, *"I want to observe what the House of Lords Constitution Committee said last week about the Childcare Bill that is progressing through Parliament. I have a copy of the Constitution Committee's report on that measure, and it is apposite to the amendments to the Education and Adoption Bill... These words are relevant to the Education and Adoption Bill and the amendments: "In our last report ... we drew attention to a concerning trend—a tendency by the Government to introduce vaguely worded legislation that leaves much to the discretion of ministers." That might describe the provisions that we are discussing today. It goes on to describe the Childcare Bill as "a particularly egregious example of this development." ... That is why that Bill*

²⁹ Col 97 3rd Sitting Thursday 2 July 2015

³⁰ Cols 191-192 5th Sitting Tuesday 7 July 2015

³¹ Col 169 5th Sitting Tuesday 7 July 2015

³² Col 99 3rd Sitting Thursday 2 July 2015

³³ Col 169 5th Sitting Tuesday 7 July 2015

³⁴ House of Lords Select Committee on the Constitution...2nd Report 2015-16 HL Paper 9 para 2

³⁵ House of Lords Select Committee on the Constitution...2nd Report 2015-16 HL Paper 9 para 3

is now in a little trouble in the other place... When this Bill makes its short journey through Central Lobby to the other end of the building, I am sure their lordships' Constitution Committee will look carefully at our deliberations and at the content and detail of this Bill. They will also note the way in which we have been conducting our business here."

Brennan put forward the proposition that, "*Ministers should have to demonstrate that they need to acquire more power*"³⁶, having suggested that parliamentarians are looking "*as to why Ministers think it is so important, so crucial, so pressing, so urgent a matter that they need to write this down in primary legislation.*"³⁷

5 Members' Activity

In the course of this study, it became evident that Members of Parliament could engage in various ways with Education issues. The various fora are set out in table 1. It is clear that in the 2015 Parliament there is a sizeable section of the House who are engaged in a number of different ways.

Contributions in Education PQs are set out in the following table. Former members are highlighted in grey.

			16/06/2014	21/07/2014	27/10/2014	01/12/2014	19/01/2015	02/03/2015	15/06/2015	Tot
Brennan, K	Cardiff West	Lab	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	7
Hunt, T	Stoke-on-Trent Central	Lab	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	7
Sheerman, B	Huddersfield	Lab	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	7
Timpson, E	Crewe and Nantwich	Cons	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	7
Boles, N	Grantham and Stamford	Cons		1	1	1	1	1	1	6
Gibb, N	Bognor Regis & Littlehampton	Cons		1	1	1	1	1	1	6
Laws, D	Yeovil	LD	1	1	1	1	1	1		6
McCabe, S	Birmingham, Selly Oak	Lab	1	1	1	1	1		1	6
Morgan, N	Loughborough	Cons		1	1	1	1	1	1	6
Dakin, N	Scunthorpe	Lab	1	1	1	1		1		5
Esterson, Bill	Sefton Central	Lab	1	1		1		1	1	5
Gyimah, S	East Surrey	Cons		1		1	1	1	1	5
Hilling, J	Bolton West	Lab		1	1	1	1	1		5
Hollobone, P	Kettering	Cons	1		1	1	1	1		5
Russell, Sir Bob	Colchester	LD	1	1		1	1	1		5
Stuart, G	Beverley and Holderness	Cons	1		1	1	1	1		5
Vaz, K	Leicester East	Lab		1	1	1	1		1	5
Wright, S	Norwich South	LD	1	1	1	1		1		5
Gwynne, A	Denton & Reddish	Lab	1		1		1	1		4
Robinson, G	Coventry North West	Lab		1			1	1	1	4
Carmichael, N	Stroud	Cons		1		1			1	3
Davies, P	Shipley	Cons		1	1	1				3
Dinenage, C	Gosport	Cons	1		1			1		3
Elphicke, C	Dover	Cons		1	1			1		3
Fovargue, Y	Makerfield	Lab				1	1	1		3
Gray, J	North Wiltshire	Cons		1	1	1				3
Green, D	Ashford	Cons			1	1		1		3
Hames, D	Chippenham	LD	1		1	1				3

³⁶ Col 164 5th Sitting Tuesday 7 July 2015

³⁷ Col 163 5th Sitting Tuesday 7 July 2015

Hillier, M	Hackney South and Shoreditch	Lab	1	1			1			3
Hopkins, K	Luton North	Lab		1			1	1		3
Johnson, D	Kingston upon Hull North	Lab	1				1		1	3
Keeley, B	Worsley and Eccles South	Lab		1	1	1				3
Leech, J	Manchester, Withington	LD		1	1	1				3
Lewell-Buck, E	South Shields	Lab	1			1			1	3
Mactaggart, F	Slough	Lab				1		1	1	3
McCarthy, K	Bristol East	Lab	1				1	1		3
McGovern, A	Wirral South	Lab				1	1	1		3
Morrice, G	Livingston	Lab	1	1			1			3
Mowat, D	Warrington South	Cons	1		1	1				3
Onwurah, C	Newcastle upon Tyne Central	Lab	1				1	1		3
Opperman, G	Hexham	Cons	1	1			1			3
Powell, L	Manchester Central	Lab	1	1	1					3
Pugh, J	Southport	LD			1		1		1	3
Stephenson, A	Pendle	Cons			1			1	1	3
Stuart, G	Birmingham, Edgbaston	Lab		1			1	1		3
Twigg, S	Liverpool, West Derby	Lab	1	1	1					3
Walker, R	Worcester	Cons	1			1	1			3
Ward, D	Bradford, East	LD	1		1	1				3
Whittaker, C	Calder Valley	Cons				1	1	1		3
Abrahams, D	Oldham East and Saddleworth	Lab		1		1				2
Alexander, H	Lewisham East	Lab	1					1		2
Ali, R	Bethnal Green and Bow	Lab	1	1						2
Andrew, S	Pudsey	Cons				1	1			2
Ashworth, J	Leicester South	Lab		1					1	2
Baldry, Sir T	Banbury	Cons		1	1					2
Blunt, C	Reigate	Cons	1	1						2
Bridgen, A	North West Leicestershire	Cons				1	1			2
Brine, S	Winchester	Cons	1		1					2
Brooke, A	Mid Dorset and North Poole	LD	1					1		2
Buck, K	Westminster North	Lab	1		1					2
Burrowes, D	Enfield, Southgate	Cons			1				1	2
Chapman, J	Darlington	Lab	1		1					2
Chishti, R	Gillingham and Rainham	Cons		1					1	2
Cunningham, A	Stockton North	Lab	1			1				2
de Bois, N	Enfield North	Cons	1			1				2
Evans, G	Weaver Vale	Cons			1	1				2
Evans, N	Ribble Valley	Cons			1			1		2
Flello, R	Stoke-on-Trent South	Lab				1			1	2
Fuller, R	Bedford	Cons	1	1						2
Gardiner,	Brent North	Lab		1			1			2
Glindon, M	North Tyneside	Lab	1	1						2
Healey, J	Wentworth and Dearne	Lab					1		1	2
Huppert, J	Cambridge	LD	1		1					2
Jackson, S	Peterborough	Cons		1					1	2
Jenrick, R	Newark	Cons						1	1	2
Kawczynski, D	Shrewsbury and Atcham	Cons		1					1	2
Lucas, I C.	Wrexham	Lab		1		1				2
Luff, Sir Peter	Mid Worcestershire	Cons			1			1		2
Mann, J	Bassetlaw	Lab			1			1		2
Marsden, G	Blackpool South	Lab					1		1	2
McCartney, J	Colne Valley	Cons	1	1						2
McDonald, A	Middlesbrough	Lab	1						1	2

McInnes, Liz	Heywood and Middleton	Lab						1	1	2
McIntosh, A	Thirsk & Malton	Cons	1			1				2
Miller, M	Basingstoke	Cons		1			1			2
Mosley, S	City of Chester	Cons	1		1					2
Munt, T	Wells	LD		1		1				2
Nandy, L	Wigan	Lab	1	1						2
Pawsey, M	Rugby	Cons			1				1	2
Phillipson, B	Houghton and Sunderland South	Lab				1	1			2
Rutley, D	Macclesfield	Cons		1	1					2
Skidmore, C	Kingswood	Cons			1				1	2
Stunell, Sir A	Hazel Grove	LD		1	1					2
Timms, S	East Ham	Lab			1	1				2
Tomlinson, J	North Swindon	Cons				1	1			2
Twigg, D	Halton	Lab			1				1	2
Allan, L	Telford	Cons							1	1
Burgon, R	Leeds East	Lab							1	1
Cox, Jo	Batley and Spen	Lab							1	1
Foxcroft, V	Lewisham, Deptford	Lab							1	1
Haigh, L	Sheffield, Heeley	Lab							1	1
Heappey, J	Wells	Cons							1	1
Kennedy, S	South Ribble	Cons							1	1
Kyle, P	Hove	Lab							1	1
Mak, A	Havant	Cons							1	1
Monaghan, C	Glasgow North West	SNP							1	1
Phillips, J	Birmingham, Yardley	Lab							1	1
Rimmer, M	St Helens South and Whiston	Lab							1	1
Tomlinson, M	Mid Dorset and North Poole	Cons							1	1
Tracey, C	North Warwickshire	Cons							1	1
West, C	Hornsey and Wood Green	Lab							1	1
Wragg, W	Hazel Grove	Cons							1	1
Adams, N	Selby and Ainsty	Cons	1							1
Afriyie, A	Windsor	Cons						1		1
Austin, I	Dudley North	Lab							1	1
Baker, S	Wycombe	Cons	1							1
Barclay, S	North East Cambridgeshire	Cons				1				1
Bayley, Hugh	York Central	Lab			1					1
Beith, Sir A	Berwick-upon-Tweed	LD	1							1
Bellingham, H	North West Norfolk	Cons							1	1
Berry, J	Rossendale and Darwen	Cons			1					1
Bingham, A	High Peak	Cons							1	1
Birtwhistle, G	Burnley	LD	1							1
Blackman-Woods, R	City of Durham	Lab					1			1
Blackwood, N	Oxford West & Abingdon	Cons					1			1
Blomfield, P	Sheffield Central	Lab		1						1
Blunkett, D	Sheffield Brightside & Hillsborough	Lab			1					1
Bone, P	Wellingborough	Cons							1	1
Bray, A	Ealing Central and Acton	Cons					1			1
Brown, L	West Ham	Lab		1						1
Brown, N	Newcastle upon Tyne East	Lab			1					1
Bruce, F	Congleton	Cons							1	1
Burden, R	Birmingham, Northfield	Lab			1					1
Byrne, L	Birmingham, Hodge Hill	Lab		1						1
Campbell, R	Blyth Valley	Lab			1					1

Carswell, D	Clacton	UKIP						1		1
Chope, C	Christchurch	Cons							1	1
Coffey, A	Stockport	Lab				1				1
Cooper, R	West Lancashire	Lab					1			1
Cryer, J	Leyton and Wanstead	Lab				1				1
Cunningham, J	Coventry South	Lab	1							1
Danczuk, S	Rochdale	Lab					1			1
Elliott, J	Sunderland Central	Lab	1							1
Evans, C	Islwyn	Lab		1						1
Field, F	Birkenhead	Lab					1			1
Field, M	Cities of London and Westminster	Cons	1							1
Freer, M	Finchley and Golders Green	Cons						1		1
George, A	St Ives	LD				1				1
Gove, M	Surrey Heath	Cons	1							1
Green, K	Stretford and Urmston	Lab							1	1
Halfon, R	Harlow	Cons	1							1
Hammond, S	Wimbledon	Cons			1					1
Hancock, M	West Suffolk	Cons	1							1
Hanson, D	Delyn	Lab					1			1
Harrington, R	Watford	Cons						1		1
Harvey, Sir N	North Devon	LD					1			1
Heald, Sir O	North East Hertfordshire	Cons					1			1
Heath, D	Somerton and Frome	LD						1		1
Hoban, M	Fareham	Cons		1						1
Hodgson, S	Washington and Sunderland West	Lab							1	1
Hoey, K	Vauxhall	Lab						1		1
Horwood, M	Cheltenham	LD					1			1
Howarth, Sir G	Aldershot	Cons						1		1
James, M	Stourbridge	Cons	1							1
Johnson, G	Dartford	Cons				1				1
Jones, M	Nuneaton	Cons				1				1
Latham, P	Mid Derbyshire	Cons					1			1
Lefroy, J	Stafford	Cons							1	1
Leigh, Sir E	Gainsborough	Cons				1				1
Leslie, C	Bristol North West	Cons						1		1
Loughton, T	East Worthing and Shoreham	Cons							1	1
Lumley, K	Redditch	Cons						1		1
Macleod, M	Brentford and Isleworth	Cons		1						1
Mahmood, S	Birmingham, Ladywood	Lab		1						1
Malhotra, S	Feltham and Heston	Lab				1				1
McPartland, S	Stevenage	Cons			1					1
Mearns, I	Gateshead	Lab	1							1
Mills, N	Amber Valley	Cons						1		1
Morris, D	Morecambe and Lunesdale	Cons					1			1
Mulholland, G	Leeds North West	LD					1			1
Munn, M	Sheffield Heeley	Lab				1				1
Murray, S	South East Cornwall	Cons	1							1
Nokes, C	Romsey and Southampton North	Cons							1	1
Ollerenshaw, E	Lancaster and Fleetwood						1			1
Opperman, G	Hexham	Cons			1					1

Poulter, D	Central Suffolk & North Ipswich	Cons							1	1
Pound, S	Ealing North	Lab				1				1
Pritchard, M	The Wrekin	Cons				1				1
Reed, J	Copeland	Lab		1						1
Robertson, J	Glasgow North West	Lab			1					1
Rotheram, S	Liverpool, Walton	Lab			1					1
Ruffley, D	Bury St Edmunds	Cons	1							1
Seabeck, A	Plymouth Moor View	Lab				1				1
Sharma, A	Reading West	Cons	1							1
Sharma, V	Ealing, Southall	Lab					1			1
Smith, A	Penistone & Stocksbridge	Lab			1					1
Smith, C	Norwich North	Cons					1			1
Smith, H	Crawley	Cons		1						1
Smith, J	Skipton and Ripon	Cons					1			1
Soames, Sir N	Mid Sussex	Cons							1	1
Spencer, M	Sherwood	Cons							1	1
Swales, I	Redcar	LD						1		1
Truss, E	South West Norfolk	Cons	1							1
Turner, A	Isle of Wight	Cons		1						1
Turner, K	Kingston upon Hull East	Lab					1			1
Vaz, V	Walsall South	Lab	1							1
Walley, J	Stoke-on-Trent North	Lab			1					1
Watts, D	St Helens North	Lab		1						1
Wheeler, H	South Derbyshire	Cons				1				1
Wilson, P	Sedgefield	Lab				1				1
Wilson, R	Reading East	Cons	1							1
Woodcock, J	Barrow & Furness	Lab							1	1
Wright, D	Telford	Lab			1					1
Zahawi, N	Stratford-on-Avon	Cons		1						1

Table 8– MPs Contributions in Education Parliamentary Questions (1=one or more contributions)